

Attention to 'race' and/or ethnicity: Additional guidance for authors and reviewers (May 2009)

RESEARCH PAPERS	Criteria		Comments
Attention to 'race' and ethnicity			
1	Does the paper engage with issues relating to 'race' and/or ethnicity?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no (skip to Q3)	
2	Is there an adequate justification as to why attention to issues relating to 'race' and/or ethnicity is warranted in this paper?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes (skip to Q6) <input type="checkbox"/> no (skip to Q6)	
For papers that do not address 'race' or ethnicity:			
3	Is there an adequate explanation as to why the paper does not engage with issues relating to 'race' and/or ethnicity?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
4	Is there an adequate discussion of the limitations that might ensue from not addressing 'race' and/or ethnicity?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
5	Does the paper nevertheless seek to inform practice and/or policy development for a 'racially' or ethnically diverse population?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
** If the paper does not include attention to 'race' or ethnicity please stop here **			
Focus of the paper and framing of the issues/questions			
6	Was the focus/framing of the research informed by those individuals or groups who are the subject of the research?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
7	Are the issues/questions framed in such a way that the multifaceted nature of 'race' and/or ethnicity is recognised?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
Concepts and terminology (ethnicity, 'race' and related concepts)			
8	Are key concepts adequately explained and justified?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
9	Have the authors used terminology consistently and appropriately?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	

Categories and labels			Comments
10	Does the paper use 'racial' or ethnic categories or 'groups'?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no (skip to Q14)	
11	Have the authors carefully considered whether the 'racial' or ethnic categories used are appropriate for the topic under investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
12	Is there sufficient detail and justification for how such categories were assigned?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
13	Have the authors adequately discussed any limitations of the categories used, be these bespoke or standard (e.g. census categories)?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
Care of research participants			
14	Does the paper report on new research/investigation that directly involved interactions with human participants?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no (skip to Q16)	
15	Were appropriate steps taken to ensure the safety and comfort of study participants regardless of their 'racial' or ethnic identity? (for instance: recognising power imbalances; conveying information appropriately; gaining consent in culturally appropriate fashion; avoidance of participant harm etc.)	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
Sampling and data generation			
16	Were samples of individuals labelled as belonging to one or more 'racial' or ethnic 'groups' used?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no (skip to Q20)	
17	Is the sampling strategy clearly explained and justified?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
18	Was the sampling strategy adequate to generate samples of the different 'racial' or ethnic 'groups' that are comparable?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
19	Was the validity/suitability of the data collection methods or instruments confirmed for the different 'racial' or ethnic 'groups'?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
20	Were data generated/gathered in more than one language?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no (skip to Q22)	
21	Were rigorous methods used for working across languages and ensuring conceptual equivalence?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	

Analyses and interpretation: comparisons and causation			Comments
	Do the analyses and interpretation:		
22	exercise appropriate caution in any claims about causal links between 'race' and/or ethnicity and experiences/outcomes? (In quantitative analyses, do the authors avoid interpreting <i>statistical associations</i> as <i>explanations/causal effects</i>)?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
23	adequately recognise the multifaceted nature of 'race' and/or 'ethnicity' and the need to consider underlying explanatory factors (whether cultural, genealogical, or socio-political)?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
24	adequately engage with the internal diversity of 'racial' and/or ethnic groups? (for instance by gender, socioeconomic, migrant status and religion)	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
25	avoid comparisons between 'racial' or ethnic 'groups' where samples are of insufficient size and/or incomparable homogeneity?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
26	give adequate attention to absolute levels of key experiences/outcomes as well as relative differences between 'groups'?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
Presentation and interpretation			
	Does the reporting and interpretation of issues/findings:		
27	avoid the potential for stereotyping, stigmatising or pathologising certain 'racial' or ethnic 'groups' or populations?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
28	illustrate adequate reflexivity in the work (e.g. acknowledging the researchers' own social position(s) and any assumptions and limitations of the methods used)?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
29	adequately acknowledge the potential role of factors beyond the scope of the analyses and/or alternative interpretations?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	
30	give adequate attention to the transferability of the findings to other research and practice contexts and any limits to this transferability?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> N/A or unsure	